



**State Of Arizona**  
**Naturopathic Physicians Board of Medical Examiners**  
"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 230 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Voice Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-3093  
TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Janet Napolitano – Governor  
Konrad Kail, ND – Chairman • Kip Micuda, JD – Vice Chairman • Deborah Chelson – Secretary/Treasurer  
Renee Waldman, NMD – Physician Member • Paul DeLoe, NMD – Physician Member  
Cathleen Field - Public Member • Linda Barron – Public Member • Craig Runbeck, NMD – Executive Director

---

**Minutes**  
**BOARD MEETING**  
**Thursday • January 13<sup>th</sup> 2005 • 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room, B-1**  
**1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007**

**1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer**

A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meeting.  
The meeting was called to order at 1:10 PM  
Dr DeLoe: Present, Dr Chelson; Present, Dr Waldman; Present, Dr Kail; present. Mr Micuda, Absent, Ms Barron, Absent, Ms Field, Absent. 4 Present, 3 Absent

B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.  
Ms Dawn Lee, Assistant Attorney General, Dr Craig Runbeck, Executive Director, Ms Paula Brierley, Deputy Director, Ms Gail Anthony, Licensing Administrator.

**2. Call to the Public**

No public wished to speak.

**3. Discussion and consideration of Consent Agenda**

Dr Christian Issels and Dr Ross Kerievsky were removed from the Consent agenda, they are employed in Dr Kail's office. Because of the 3 Board members that were absent, Dr Kail could not recuse himself, the Board would then not have a quorum. Dr Issels and Dr Kerivsky will be added to the next Board agenda for consideration of renewal of licensure.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr DeLoe moved to accept the Consent agenda, Second by Dr Chelson, motion carried 4 Ayes, 3 Absent

A. **Approval of Minutes:** Review, discussion and vote on minutes of December 9<sup>th</sup>, 2004  
The minutes of December 9<sup>th</sup>, 2004 were approved.

B. **Executive Director Report:** Summary of Current Events  
The Executive Directors report was approved.

C. **Approval of Medical License(s) / Examination Application**

Ave Sims	Denise Quance
----------	---------------

The issuance of Medical license(s) were approved.

**D. Approval of Application(s) for Renewal of Medical License**

Douglas Nichols	Nathan Vitaro
Shanna Tobar	Leah Anderson
Barbara Koudleka	Cheryl Granger
Kate Kennedy	Robert Myers
Kristen O'Rourke	Mona Morstein
Bradley Smith	Valeria Wyckoff
Timothy Peace	Christine Madsen
Virginia Keilty	Lissa McNiel
Veronique Pangia	Andrea Weiner
Allyn Krieger-Fiedler	Kathleen Collins
Nicole Barreda	Damien Brandeis
Barbara Brooks	Mary DiFilippo
Eugene Eihausen	Daniel Kellman
Markain Babij	Melenie Dunn
Ciara Gail	Brian Popiel
Grant McKernan	Kannamma Kannan
Bruce Davis	Clare Garcia
Allison Pritchard	Sharon Stills
Stacy Riseborough	Kelly Hanningan
John Imundo	Yolanda Rodruquez
Teresa Vesco	Lori Barnes
Kenneth Proefrock	Adrienne Borg
Judy Petersen	Susan Whiting
Christian Armanti	Drew Collins
Susan Wojcik	William Nelson
Norman Wallace	George Miles
Miriam Gilbert	Ann Murray
Peggy McGarey	Arlan Cage
Herbert Schuck	
Amy Whittington	Karsten Alexandria
Valerie Nix	Monique Lai
Julie Keiffer	Boris Schwartz
Mary Marcantel	Susan Rudderham
Mark Rudderham	Eric Bower
J D McCoy	Susan Shahidi
Anna Nordin	Laura Boe
Jonathan Kalman	Louise Gutowski
Brandy Pierce	Sam Walters
James hutton	Samuel Flagler
Lila Flagler	Chad Goetz
Susan Stratton	Craig Wagstaff
Nancy Mullis	Kathryn Brookman
Maria Bell	Glenn Ozalan
Shelly Weisman	Denise Duda Dox
Carol Revak	Ken Blackman
Robert Johnson	Randall Robinson
Mark Green	Christopher Spooner
Susan Williams	Michael Chung
Judy Hiell	Dawn Bantel

Bruce Sadilek	Angela Bilyeu
Christopher Jayne	Robert Milisen
Michele Caragiulo	Matthew Baral
Mercedes Williams	Jeffrey Winton
Olya Stouk	F Debbie Jacques
John Hartman	Mary Ellen O'Brien
Stephanie Eastman	David Craig
Anne Marie Fine	Roxie Strand
John Hinze	Miriam Weber
	Julie Nowak
Robert Morrissey	Bruce Scher
N. Marley Robertson	Andrew Kaufmann
Ellen Satinsky	Carol Jamison
Diaa Osamn	Murray Dowell
Robert Upchurch	Christine Sorrensen
Hope Farner	Paul Stallone
Albert Chavez	Yezid Callejas
Maureen Wilson	Theresa Ramsey
Lucinda Messer	Rebecca Carpenter
Kathleen McCaleb	Veronica Boyer
Ross Dunbar	Carlos Santo
Steven Jarrett	Daniela Hutyrova
J Michael Pece	Holly Castle
Kimberly Slagel	Teri Davis
Christine Yerby	Tilli Williams
Delores D'Aprile	Kareen O'Brien
Andria Orlowski	Paul Anderson
Christina Tondora	Elizabeth Thybulle
Inge Barth	Michelle Mossell
Ty Tallman	Decker Weiss
Frances March	Patricia Gaines
Edward Geller	Sonja Tveit-Pettersen
Christina Kovalik	Paul Conyette
Jeanette Gallagher	Lisa Amerine
Roger Adair	June Stevens
Susan Hawkins	Teresa Rada
Michael Berke	Kathy Kamin
Karen Van Der Veer	Pat Hallman
Shanon Maltais	David Tallman
John Dye	Elizabeth Grady
Chad Schroer	Gene De Ment
Theo Christodoulakis	Ralph Potter
Marima Malek	Gilberto Leon
Kathleen Muratore	Marianna Fisher
Marlene Briggs	Kimberly Engard
Karen Sigurdson	Adam Kerievsky
Allen Anderson	Shaida Sina
Amy O'Hara	Sarv Varta Khalsa
John Hawrylak	Shairoz Karim
Michael Smith	Mario Galburri
Harold Ofgang	Michael Allen

David Daily	Chriselda Beltran
Cheryl Larson	Eric Udell
Danite Haller	William Troutt
Michael Uzick	Janice Highfield
Jennifer Craten	Diana Kraus
Apryl Krause	Ramon Esquerdo
Matthew Marturano	Michelle Tucker
Sara Rodgers	Amy Jane Lilie
Camille Teale	Mark Janikula
Laura Mittman	Paul Mittman
Jacqueline Carboni	Tue Truong
Thomas Lee	James Witman
Janice Skelton	Donald Smith
Jami Kupperman	Michelle Turcotte
Don Griffith	Heidi Koerner
Bruce Canvasser	Yvonne Skinner
Jacqueline Arnold	Will Polec
Jennifer Trask	Dorothy Karcheski
Clinton McJunkin	Danette Dehnicke
Danette King	Nancy Aton Robins
Gladys Ceballos Logan	Tara Barker
Shawn Joyner	Ravi Chandiramani
Mary Poore	Steve Ehrlick
Michael Sutton	Marie Santora
Christina Compton	Michael Di Palma
Jilliam Finker	Meannine Maschek
JoAnn Yanez	Kerri Clark-Heidel
John Oxley	Barbara Oxley
Katrina Steinberger	Linda Kim
Dawn Eller	Jeffrey Knytyc h
Ann Seipt	Ruth Bar Shalom
Lance Hering	Marjorie Peak
Candice Jackson	Heather Waldor
Robert Streisfeld	Gilbert Alvarado
Deborah Vacik	Alan Kadish
Barbara Dapcic	Elfrieda Conrad
Emmanouiel Karampahtsis	Patricia Herman
Karen D'Huyvetter	Kevon Arthurs
Jesse Haggard	James Tuggle
Richard Putnam	Suneil Jain
Babak Nafe	Bryan McConnell

The Renewal of the license(s) were approved by the Board

**E. Approval of Application(s) / Request(s) to Retire Medical License**

Sandro D'Amico	Robin Borsa
Paula Milisen	Mary Shackelton
Rodger Moore	

The Retirement of license(s) were approved by the Board

**F. Approval of Application(s) for Certificate to Dispense (initial)**

Chad Goetz	Sara Rodgers
Jacqueline Carboni	Danite Haller

The issuance of the Certificate(s) to Dispense were approved by the Board.

#### **4. Regulatory Matters**

##### **A. Discussion and Consideration of Investigations and Complaints**

###### **(1) Investigative Interview: 05-008 – Dr. Lance Morris, 97-485**

Dr Morris was present made statements and answered questions by the Board. After discussion and consideration, Dr Chelson moved to issue consent agreement for a Letter of Reprimand, Second by Dr DeLoe. Roll Call : Dr DeLoe, Aye, Dr Chelson, Aye, Dr Waldman, Aye, Dr Kail, Aye. 4 Ayes, Motion carried 4 Ayes, 3 Absent.

###### **(2) Investigative Interview: 05-010 – Dr. Jorge Badillo Cochran, 92-422**

Dr Cochran was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, this item was tabled pending response by the AzNMA on approval or disapproval of CME hours that were submitted by Dr Cochran to the AzNMA.

###### **(3) Investigative Interview: 05-011 – Dr. Scott Jamison, 96-465**

Dr Jamison was present, made statements and answered questions, after discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr Chelson made a motion to issue a consent agreement for probation until CME's are met for 2003. The term of probation will be for a period of 12 months or until the CME's are met for 2003. The Board will consider Dr Jamison to use the extra hours he has received from Pharmacology modules, and apply to the hours needed. Second by Dr Waldman, Roll Call: Dr DeLoe, Aye, Dr Chelson, Aye, Dr Waldman, Aye, Dr Kail, Aye. 4 Ayes, 3 Absent

###### **(4) Investigative Interview: 05-016 – Dr. Chad Livdahl, 01-668**

The item was moved before the consent agenda due to time restrictions of Mr Gurkey who was present to make statements to the Board on behalf of Dr Chad Livdahl. Dr Livdahl was not present. Mr Gurkey made statements to the Board regarding item 4 A (4). After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr Chelson moved to move this item to Formal Interview., Second by Dr DeLoe, Roll Call: Dr DeLoe, Aye, Dr Chelson, Aye, Dr Waldman, Aye, Dr Kail, Aye. 4 Ayes, 3 Absent

###### **(5) Investigative Interview: 05-017 – Dr. Zahra Karim, 01-669**

The item was moved before the consent agenda due to time restrictions of Mr Gurkey who was present to make statements to the Board on behalf of Dr Zahra Karim.. Dr Karim was not present. Mr Gurkey made statements to the Board regarding item 4 A (5). After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr Chelson moved to move this item to Formal Interview., Second by Dr DeLoe, Roll Call: Dr DeLoe, Aye, Dr Chelson, Aye, Dr Waldman, Aye, Dr Kail, Aye. 4 Ayes, 3 Absent

##### **B. Discussion and Consideration of Persons Under Consent Agreement**

###### **(1) Dr. Lance Morris, 97-485 - Scheduled Update**

No action required by the Board on this item.

##### **C. Discussion and Consideration of Persons Licensed by this Board**

###### **(1) Dr. Debra Chelson License Renewal**

This item was tabled until the next Board meeting for lack of quorum if Dr Chelson were to recuse herself.

###### **(2) Dr Eugene Pontius, License Renewal**

Answered Yes to question on renewal: Were you arrested in 2004 or charged with any criminal act?

Dr Pontis and his Attorney Mr. Denver Snuffer were not present due to a prior commitment in Provo Utah regarding a hearing on Dr Pontis's charges. After discussion and consideration by the Board, this item was table pending more information.

**5. Discussion and Consideration of Administrative and Procedural Matters**

**A. Propagation of Rules**

After discussion and consideration , the Board directed Dr Runbeck to gather further information regarding the propagation of rules concerning compounding and dispensing.

**B. Election of Board Officers for 2005**

Because of the absence of 3 Board members, this item was tabled until the next Board meeting.

**C. Update of AUIM test results / Clinical Competencies**

Dr Craig Runbeck gave an update to the Board regarding the AUIM test results.

The Board directed Dr Runbeck to address options on grading clinical competencies of the AUIM graduates who have passed the special examinations given by the Board, and who are applying for a Naturopathic Medical License through NPBOMEX.

**6. Discussion and consideration of Correspondence and Questions for the Board.**

**A. Email from Dean Hughson regarding article in Palm Beach Post: Dr. Zahra Karim and Dr. Chad Livdahl.**

No action was required by the Board on this matter.

**THE BOARD MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT 2:32 PM.**

**SIGNED \_\_\_\_\_ THIS DAY OF \_\_\_\_\_**  
**NATUROPATHIC PHYSICIANS BOARD OF MEDICAL EXAMINERS**